

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Subject	Socioeconomic Equity Working Group Studies/Research/Best Practices Subcommittee Meeting #3 Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Planning Framework	Date	April 29, 2021
Facilitator	Ashley Montgomery	Time	11:00am – 12:00am
Location	WebEx - https://governor.virginia.gov/i/lwmww	Scribe	Shurui Zhang

Invitees/Attendees			
#	Name	Organization/Role	Attended?
Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee Members and Staff Advisors			
1.	Ashley Montgomery - Lead	Associate Designer, Hanbury	Y
2.	Dr. Karen McGlathery	Director, Environmental Resilience Institute at the University of Virginia	Y
3.	Shurui Zhang - Staff	Commonwealth Coastal and Marine Policy Fellow, Virginia Sea Grant	Y
4.	Dr. Carl Hershner	Emeritus Professor of Marine Science, Virginia Institute of Marine Science at William & Mary	Y
5.	Catherine C. McGhee	Director of Research and Innovation, Virginia Transportation Research Council	N
6.	Carlos Rivero	Chief Data Officer	Y
Other Participants			
7.	Ann Phillips	Rear Admiral, US Navy (Ret.) – Office of the Governor	Y
8.	Matt Dalon	DCR	Y
9.	Connor Winstead	DCR	Y
Consultant Support			
10.	Johanna Greenspan-Johnston	Dewberry	Y

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
1.	Welcome and Chapter 1289 Reading	Ashley Montgomery provided an introduction on how the meeting will proceed, meeting etiquette, and requested participants to ask questions through the chat box. Public comments will be taken during the last 30 minutes of the meeting from the chat box from those attendees who registered to speak. He then read through the required Chapter 1289 virtual meeting language. Please contact Shurui Zhang at phone: 217-979-8438 if you have any connectivity issues.
2.	Roll Call and Quorum Affirmation	Shurui Zhang took roll and advised that a quorum was present. Ashley Montgomery asked for a motion to move forward with the virtual meeting. Dr. Karen McGlathery moved and Dr. Carl Hershner seconded. Motion Passed unanimously.
3.	Welcome and Introduction	Ashley Montgomery introduced the agenda.
4.	Framing our Scope	Ashley Montgomery showed a working narrative of the working group based on the Master Planning Framework (See Slides Attachment), and provided brief explanations for each point. Dr. Karen McGlathery added that there are both short-term and long-term goals for the working group. The long-term goal is to help advise the Commonwealth on best practices to engage communities and make equitable decisions. The short-term goal is to provide answers for Dewberry given the constricted timeline.

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Q – Ann Phillips – Karen you said that you haven't seen the questions from Dewberry, was that related to the outreach specifically or related to the development of their conceptual modal. Those questions have been distributed to the subcommittee chairs. • A – Dr. Karen McGlathery – I am speaking for myself because I just took over the subcommittee chair. If Robert were here, he will give us some input on what those questions were. • Dr. Carl Hershner – There are two sets of questions. One set is what you distributed to the subcommittee chairs and vice-chairs about the conceptual framework. There are detailed questions, and as far as I know, only the Project ID and Project Evaluation subcommittee have seen the specific questions. • A – Ann Phillips – We took a spreadsheet from their conceptual model and broke it down for each subcommittee to answer questions related to them. These questions have been distributed. • Ashley Montgomery – It might be beneficial for this working group to share those questions, so we are aware of the questions being asked at other groups and contribute to those conversations. • Dr. Carl Hershner – The questions for the Project Evaluation subcommittee indicated efforts to assess equity. I think it's useful for us to acknowledge to Dewberry the information from the AdaptVA website is an acceptable first cut. From a state perspective, we are going to need a more resolved analysis of at-risk communities. It might be helpful for Dewberry to reach out to localities to begin the process of getting self-identified concern areas. This group can provide some guidance for the metrics. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – I completely agree with Carl. I think census block is what we have to start with and we need to get better information about the appropriate scale. It's not just neighborhood-scale, but it could be groups of people. The other thing is that Dewberry talked about creating a tool kit and distributing it to NGOs for them to use door-to-door. I think we need to get input from them on how they are planning to do on-the-group work and how we can help make it more effective. It would be good to have some detail from Dewberry if they are planning to do that in the next month or two. • Ashley Montgomery – This is also a question we asked in our Outreach subcommittee meeting yesterday. The outreach strategy is at a high level. Though we understand the constraints, there is not a directive of how the process is going to work. In the Outreach subcommittee, we do think there needs to be some kind of framework in place to connect what we have access to now and how we can gather insights. • Dr. Carl Hershner – There was a GIS tool developed before I retired. We were working with the health department, social services, and localities to identify areas of concern. It might be useful if Dewberry and the state require localities that are submitting projects to begin the process of delineating areas of equity concern. It can provide some mechanism for a large-scale assessment of whether we are comprehensive enough for the coastal region. • Ashley Montgomery – I like that approach because it's centering the communities and gives them ownership. I wonder if it is possible to request the process that localities have tools to help them.

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ann Phillips – If we want localities to identify specific areas of concern, they certainly have opinions, we would give them some criteria that we ask them to consider. The Community Flood Preparedness fund is supposed to do the same thing. Dewberry’s outreach and engagement in public relations, messaging and helping to facilitate. It is not knocking on doors. As you heard from yesterday’s meeting, there are non-profit who are interested n being part of this, but it is challenging to get one of them to take the lead because they are consumed with COVID and other near-term issues. We will do what we can with the service from Vision Planning and Consulting. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – Who are the NGOs that you or Dewberry are talking about? • Ann Phillips – CCAN (Chesapeake Climate Action Network) hosted several meetings with like-minded non-profits in the Hampton Roads region. Sierra Club, Lynnhaven River Now, Elizabeth River Project, and EDF. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – Is on-the-ground work realistic for this summer if it is not coordinated? I wonder if our focus should be helping Dewberry and identify criteria for localities to self-identify. • Ann Phillips – Realistically I think we are not going to have a lot of success door-to-door works. We are still struggling to get through with COVID which is impacting many communities we want to talk to. Getting the localities to self-identify would be a way. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – Ashley and I have talked about how do we get information about equity into the project evaluation process. • Dr. Carl Hershner – We are limited in the short-term and acknowledge these concerns long-term. Once localities begin to self-identify and the metric they are using to identify equity issues become public, there will be a stimulus to get group engagement and make the whole process more inclusive. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – The key is not to just go through the PDCs but to identify who the local leaders are. That is the process the Climate Equity Atlas is taking through the UVA Equity Center. They will talk to our subcommittees about their process. We are all talking about the same thing and putting tools into a framework people can use. The key is that it is not a top-down approach, but what the communities identify as their needs are. Figuring out how to have that process would be important. • Ashley Montgomery – It seems that we have a current database that Dewberry can start with. I think the focus for our working group is for us to refine a process for equity and engagement. The Community Outreach subcommittee is putting together a database of organizations across the coastal regions. Maybe that’s a list we can expand in TAC to get more perspectives. Our group’s focus for this first round is to offload the data we have and formulate a process to move forwards with intentional equity. • Dr. Carl Hershner – That’s a brilliant thought. What parameters you’re thinking of in terms of equity in the context of resilience? If you are going out to identify those communities, what characteristics do you think would be most useful? • Ashley Montgomery – When we do our planning process, we try to layer all the existing data to understand where hot spots are. From there, I center the community’s lived experiences. There are a couple of community-based

Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>working groups and they have process toolkits, like Virginia Community Voice. We can start to pair localities with these activist groups.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Carl Hershner – From a state perspective, if we are trying to get equitable solutions across the entire coastal zone, we will need to identify universal metrics to compare what’s being done in different localities. The challenge is how do you assess equity at the state level. • Ashley Montgomery – When you start to layer over qualitative with quantitative, it helps us to check ourselves. • Dr. Karen McGlathery – Caril I think If you are trying to assess equity over the whole coastal zone, it’s a challenge to come up with one metric to encapsulate all aspects of vulnerability. Our biggest challenge is that the tool we are developing is quantitative; it can include ecological, social, economic indices or internet access. The communities can select what matters to them, so it’s a singular process but not a singular metric. • Dr. Carl Hershner – I agree with you. My question for you and Ashley is that if we are selecting a small set of beginning metrics, what’s your shortlist of important things to consider? • Dr. Karen McGlathery – Poverty level, race, education, English as a second language, accessibility to roads, etc. I would add internet access as well because it turns out to be an important aspect, especially for rural communities. We need to be open to thinking about self-identified metrics within localities, and what we hadn’t thought about. • Dr. Carl Hershner – I agree with everything you listed, and that’s what we could send Dewberry now. •
5.	Public Comment Period	There is no public comment.
6.	Adjourn	Ashley Montgomery asked for motion to adjourn. Dr. Karen McGlathery moved; Carl Hershner seconded. Motion passed unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 12:00pm.